## 

## PAUL, WEISS, RIFKIND, WHARTON & GARRISON LLP

1285 AVENUE OF THE AMERICAS NEW YORK, NEW YORK 10019-6064

TELEPHONE (212) 373-3000

LLOYD K. GARRISON (1946-1991)
RANDOLPH E. PAUL (1946-1956)
SIMON H. RIFKIND (1950-1950)
LOUIS S WEISS (1927-1950)
JOHN F. WHARTON (1927-1977)

WRITER'S DIRECT DIAL NUMBER

(212) 373-3316

WRITER'S DIRECT FACSIMILE

(212) 492-0316

WRITER'S DIRECT E-MAIL ADDRESS

bkarp@paulweiss.com

July 25, 2014

UNIT 3601, OFFICE TOWER A. BEIJING FORTUNE PLAZA
NO. 7 DONGSANHUAN ZHONGLU
CHAOYANG DISTRICT
BEIJING 100020
PEOPLE'S REPUBLIC OF CHINA
TELEPHONE (86-10) 5828-6300

12TH FLOOR, HONG KONG CLUB BUILDING 3A CHATER ROAD, CENTRAL HONG KONG TELEPHONE (852) 2846-0300

ALDER CASTLE
10 NOBLE STREET
LONDON ECZY 7JU, U.K.
TELEPHONE (44 20) 7367 1600

FUKOKU SEIMEI BUILDING 2-2 UCHISAIWAICHO 2-CHOME CHIYODA-KU, TOKYO 100-0011, JAPAN TELEPHONE (81-3) 3597-8101

TORONTO-DOMINION CENTRE
77 KING STREET WEST, SUITE 3100
PO. BOX 226
TORONTO, ONTARIO MSK 1J3
TELEPHONE (416) 504-0520

2001 K STREET, NW WASHINGTON, DC 20006-1047 TELEPHONE (202) 223-7300

500 DELAWARE AVENUE, SUITE 200 POST OFFICE BOX 32 WILMINGTON, DE 19899-0032 TELEPHONE (302) 655-4410 MATTHEW W. ABBOTT
ALLAN J. ARFFA
ROBERT A. ATKINS
DOHN F. BAUGHMAN
LYNN B. BAYARD
DANIEL J. BELLER
CRAIG A. BENSON
MITCHEL L. BERG
MITCHEN BOOK TEIN
DANIEL J. BERGEN
MITCHEN BOOK TEIN
DISTANCE BOOK TEIN
JESSICA S. CAREY
JESSICA S. CAR

ROBERTA A. KAPLAN
BRAD S. KARP
PATRICK N. KARSNITZ
JATRICK N. KARSNITZ
JATRICK N. KARSNITZ
JATRICK N. KARSNITZ
JERNAL K. W.
BRAN K.
BRA

\*NOT ADMITTED TO THE NEW YORK BAR

## By FedEx & E-mail

William N. Sinclair, Esq. Silverman, Thompson, Slutkin, White LLC 201 N. Charles St., Suite 2600 Baltimore, MD 21201

Dent, et al. v. Nat'l Football League, Case No. 14-cv-02324-WHA (N.D. Cal.)

Dear Mr. Sinclair:

We represent the National Football League in *In re: National Football League Players' Concussion Injury Litigation* (No. 2:12-md-02323-AB, MDL No. 2323) (E.D. Pa.) (the "NFL MDL Litigation").

We have reviewed your July 11, 2014 letter requesting that the preliminarily approved class action settlement in the NFL MDL Litigation (the "Class Action Settlement") be amended to exclude the allegations, facts, claims and circumstances in the *Dent* litigation. For the reasons explained below, we cannot agree to your request and will oppose any application or objection that seeks to amend the Class Action Settlement in this fashion.

As you know, the Class Action Settlement expressly covers Claims (as defined in Section 18.1) "arising out of, or relating to, <u>head, brain and/or cognitive injury</u>... of whatever cause and its damages ... including, without limitation, Claims for ... mental or physical pain or suffering, emotional or mental harm ... (See, e.g., Class

PAUL, WEISS, RIFKIND, WHARTON & GARRISON LLP

William N. Sinclair, Esq.

2

Action Settlement Agreement as of June 25, 2014 at § 18.1(a)(ii), NFL MDL Litigation, Doc. No. 6073-2 (emphasis added).)

The Dent amended complaint can be read broadly as seeking recovery for the very same injuries—that is, ". . . mental injuries" (e.g., Dent Compl. ¶¶ 272(c)-(d), 275, 361, 370, 386, 392). In other parts of the Dent complaint, however, it appears that the plaintiffs are seeking recovery solely for physical injuries unrelated to head, brain and/or cognitive injuries so as to avoid any overlap with the NFL MDL Litigation. (See generally id. ¶¶ 127-32, 145-84.)

To the extent we correctly read the *Dent* complaint as seeking to recover for head, brain and/or cognitive injuries, those claims are released as part of the Class Action Settlement, and we decline to amend the Class Action Settlement to exclude them. On the other hand, to the extent we misread the Dent complaint in this regard—and the Dent complaint seeks recovery solely for physical injuries other than head, brain and/or cognitive injuries—then there is no overlap between the cases and there is nothing to amend in the Class Action Settlement. In that event, we suggest that the *Dent* plaintiffs amend their complaint to remove any references to head, brain and/or cognitive injuries. In either event, we would appreciate clarification from you on this point.

Finally, we note that to the extent the *Dent* complaint seeks to prosecute claims that are released as part of the Class Action Settlement, the Dent action has been enjoined by the July 7, 2014 order issued in the NFL MDL Litigation granting preliminary approval of the Class Action Settlement. (See Order ¶ 6, NFL MDL Litigation, Doc. 6084.) We respectfully request that you promptly notify your clients of this injunction and take all necessary steps to comply with it by ceasing to prosecute any claims related to head, brain and/or cognitive injuries.

Sincerely.

Christopher A. Seeger, Esq. (by email only) cc:

Sol Weiss, Esq. (by email only)

Arnold Levin, Esq. (by email only)

Dianne M. Nast, Esq. (by email only)

Steven C. Marks, Esq. (by email only)

Gene Locks, Esq. (by email only)